慶應義塾大学学術情報リポジトリ
Keio Associated Repository of Academic resouces

Title	The hidden connection between Kant and scholasticism
Sub Title	
Author	Ertl, Wolfgang
Publisher	
Publication year	2024
Jtitle	科学研究費補助金研究成果報告書 (2023.)
JaLC DOI	
Abstract	このプロジェクトの全体的な目的は、哲学史においてこれまで無視されてきたつながりを浮き彫りにすることでした。というのは、カントの学問的先人たちは、通常、カントの批判的プロジェクトが克服するはずだったまさにその種類の独断的哲学の代表とみなされているからです。 このプロジェクトで行われた研究により、ルイス・デ・モリーナとカントにおける人間の自由意志へのアプローチには深い類似性があることが明らかになりました。人間の自由意志と自然因果決定論の両立を確立しようとするカントの中核概念は、自由の反事実に関するモリーナの有名な概念の観点から解釈できます。 The overall aim of this project has been to highlight a so-far neglected connection in the history of philosophy, since Kant's scholastic predecessors are usually seen as representatives of precisely the kind of dogmatic philosophy which Kant's critical project was supposed to overcome. The research conducted in this project has revealed that there is a deep similarity in the approach to human free will in Luis de Molina and Kant. Kant's core concept by means of which he tries to establish the compatibility of human free will and natural causal determinism can be interpreted in terms of Molina's famous conception of counterfactuals of freedom. Counterfactuals of freedom indicate how a free agent would act in a fully specified possible situation, and an intelligible character can be said to consist of the totality of all true counterfactuals about an individual free will.
Notes	研究種目：基盤研究 (C) (一般) 研究期間：2018～2023 課題番号：18K00019 研究分野：Philosophy/Ethics
Genre	Research Paper
URL	https://koara.lib.keio.ac.jp/xoonips/modules/xoonips/detail.php?koara_id=KAKEN_18K00019seika

慶應義塾大学学術情報リポジトリ(KOARA)に掲載されているコンテンツの著作権は、それぞれの著作者、学会または出版社/発行者に帰属し、その権利は著作権法によって保護されています。引用にあたっては、著作権法を遵守してご利用ください。

The copyrights of content available on the KeiO Associated Repository of Academic resources (KOARA) belong to the respective authors, academic societies, or publishers/issuers, and these rights are protected by the Japanese Copyright Act. When quoting the content, please follow the Japanese copyright act.

様　式　Ｃ－１９、Ｆ－１９－１、Ｚ－１９　（共通）

科学研究費助成事業　　研究成果報告書

令和　６ 年　 ６ 月　 ３ 日現在

機関番号：３２６１２
研究種目：基盤研究(C)（一般）
研究期間：2018～2023
課題番号：１８Ｋ００００１９

研究課題名（和文）The hidden connection between Kant and scholasticism

研究課題名（英文）The hidden connection between Kant and scholasticism

研究代表者
エアトル　ヴォルフガング（ERTL, WOLFGANG）

慶應義塾大学・文学部（三田）・教授

研究者番号：３０４０７１５０

交付決定額（研究期間全体）：（直接経費）　　3,500,000円

研究成果の概要（和文）：このプロジェクトの全体的な目的は、哲学史においてこれまで無視されてきたつながりを浮き彫りにすることでした。というのは、カントの学問的先人たちは、通常、カントの批判的プロジェクトが克服するはずだったまさにその種類の独断的哲学の代表とみなされているからです。
このプロジェクトで行われた研究により、ルイス・デ・モリーナとカントにおける人間の自由意志へのアプローチには深い類似性があることが明らかになりました。 人間の自由意志と自然因果決定論の両立を確立しようとするカントの中核概念は、自由の反事実に関するモリーナの有名な概念の観点から解釈できます。

研究成果の学術的意義や社会的意義
この計画は、特に思想史と哲学史についての、根強く広く保持されている見解の重要な修正を提供することに貢献しました。 確立された意見に疑問を投げかける例です。また、現代哲学だけでなく近代性全般における重要人物の一人の再評価も行っています。
このプロジェクトの目的は、たとえそれがかなり野心的で自慢に聞こえるかもしれないとしても、カントの哲学のより説得力のある理解を獲得することです。このような理解は、哲学の主要な代表者の一人についての正確な全体像を提供するだけでなく、哲学史の正確な全体像を提供するためにも非常に重要です。

研究成果の概要（英文）：The overall aim of this project has been to highlight a so-far neglected connection in the history of philosophy, since Kant's scholastic predecessors are usually seen as representatives of precisely the kind of dogmatic philosophy which Kant's critical project was supposed to overcome.
The research conducted in this project has revealed that there is a deep similarity in the approach to human free will in Luis de Molina and Kant. Kant's core concept by means of which he tries to establish the compatibility of human free will and natural causal determinism can be interpreted in terms of Molina's famous conception of counterfactuals of freedom. Counterfactuals of freedom indicate how a free agent would act in a fully specified possible situation, and an intelligible character can be said to consist of the totality of all true counterfactuals about an individual free will.

研究分野：Philosophy/Ethics

キーワード：Free Will　Kant　Transcendental Idealism　Scholasticism

※科研費による研究は、研究者の自覚と責任において実施するものです。そのため、研究の実施や研究成果の公表等については、国の要請等に基づくものではなく、その研究成果に関する見解や責任は、研究者個人に帰属します。

様　式　Ｃ－１９、Ｆ－１９－１（共通）

１．研究開始当初の背景

Usually, rationalist philosophers such as Descartes, Spinoza and Leibniz or empiricists such as Hume, as well as Rousseau and Moral Sense Theorists are considered to be the points of reference for Kant's philosophy, while a minority of commentators has been looking at German school philosophy as the crucial context. Sometimes, Kant's approach, especially, with regard to specifics of his practical philosophy, such as his doctrine of the highest good, is compared to Aristotle and the Stoics. Medieval and early modern philosophy, by contrast, has not received much attention, especially when it comes to Scholasticism.

２．研究の目的

The purpose of this project has been to obtain a more convincing understanding of Kant's philosophy, even if this may sound rather ambitious. Such an understanding is of enormous importance not only for providing a correct picture of one of the key representatives of philosophy, but of history of philosophy altogether.
The project has been meant not only to provide clarity about issues of crucial importance for Kant, which is indispensable for an account of his philosophy as a whole, but hopefully it also yields an explanation as to why these central claims raise such problems for interpretation and reconstruction. In short, it is shown that Kant is in a sense more alien and distant to us than often thought. To be sure, this does not mean that we cannot use his thoughts for our own philosophical efforts but doing so is far less straightforward and obvious than often assumed.
Moreover, opening up a connection between Kant to an often neglected but important part of the history of philosophy will be helpful for overcoming rather simplistic views about progress in the history of philosophy.

３．研究の方法

The method employed is a combination of historiography of ideas on the one hand and analytic strategies of elucidating the systematic structure of arguments and doctrines held by Kant on the other. Classic topics have been addressed, such as the problem as to how the argument for the thesis of the 3rd antinomy is supposed to work, how Kant's seemingly incompatible models of the relationship of things in themselves and appearances can be reconciled, what the point is of Kant's conjoining the good will with a formal principle of morality and how his surprising claims regarding the certain attainment of the highest political good can be rendered coherent.

４．研究成果

The main results of this project can be summarized in more detail by looking at some of the main publications produced in this framework.

My monograph in the *Cambridge Element Series* on Kant's Guarantee of Perpetual Peace addresses three questions about Kant's guarantee thesis by examining the so-called first addendum of his Philosophical Sketch: how the guarantor powers interrelate, how there can be a guarantee without undermining freedom and why there is a guarantee in the first place. Kant's conception of an interplay of human and divine rational agency encompassing nature is crucial: on moral grounds, we are warranted to believe the "world author" knew that if he were to bring about the world, the "supreme" good would come about too. Perpetual peace is the condition that enables the supreme good to be realized in history.

In my review article of Rossi's (2019) new book I deal with his emphasis on the prominent role of enlightened religion in the political project of establishing perpetual peace. My paper

discusses Rossi's stance on the question as to whether Kant, in his later years, moved to an immanentist conception of the highest good. Kant's own position in this regard can arguably be better described as comprehensive, according to which an immanent and a transcendent conception of the highest good are upheld as realizable side by side. Rossi's account looks perfectly consistent with such a view. One of the reasons for such a comprehensive reading is that "immanent" and "secular" do not coincide in Kant in the first place. Seen in this comprehensive way, and while a version of the highest good ought to be realized immanently, we cannot be certain that this will indeed happen. If it does indeed happen, the immortality postulate, which Kant never abandoned, renders it rational to believe that the immanent version of the highest good is merely a step towards its transcendent realization. Affinities of Rossi's approach to the suggestion that Kant subscribes to a political theology based on what has been called "Molinism minimally defined" are also explored.

In my paper on "Free Will, Foreknowledge and Creation", I argue as follows: While Kant's position concerning human freedom and divine foreknowledge is perhaps the least Molinist element of his multifaceted take on free will, Kant's Molinism (minimally defined) is undeniable when it comes to the threat ensuing from the idea of creation. In line with incompatibilism and with careful qualifications in place, he ultimately suggests regarding free agents as uncreated. Given the limitations of our rational insight, this assumption is indispensable for granting that finite free agents can acquire their intelligible characters by themselves. Nonetheless, Kant concedes that creation may, as a matter of fact, be compatible with what for Molina is the pre-volitionality of the counterfactuals of freedom.

In a further, almost completed but so far not yet published manuscript I draw on Kant's account of the divine intellect for an interpretation of the distinction of things in themselves and appearances ("Distinction") which can accommodate or reconcile Kant's two seemingly incompatible models of a metaphysical two-aspects-view and a two-objects-view. Kant's conception of the *intellectus archetypus* is shown to be surprisingly similar to that of Aquinas and other scholastics who subscribe to the doctrine that divine cognition is idea-based, albeit of course not in the technical sense of "ideas of reason" pertinent in Kant's oeuvre according to which ideas are concepts. The 'old way of ideas' is then identified as a device for rendering coherent Kant's twofold account of noumena in the *Critique of Pure Reason* and for providing a new and more comprehensive distinction of different type of noumenal entities altogether. The thesis that there are more types of noumenal entities than previously assumed is then identified as instrumental for the accommodating interpretation of the distinction of things in themselves and appearances to succeed.

This so-far ignored type of noumena is a noumenon in the sense of a merely intentional object to which the divine mind is directed and which represents noumena in a more conventional sense, namely for example things in themselves as conceived of in a metaphysical two-aspects view. It is this type of noumena in Kant which has not yet been properly acknowledged in the literature so far.

I plan to follow up on this project by writing another monograph on this topic, with a particular focus on Kant's Molinism. My aim will be to distinguish a core and a penumbra of Kant's Molinism. The penumbra concerns Kant's doctrine of free will and its compatibility with various forms of determinism, while the penumbra concerns three adjacent topics, namely Kant's philosophy of history, his doctrine of radical evil and his doctrine of grace. I belief that such an approach can really be illuminating and help us better understand some of Kant's most famous but notoriously obscure core ideas. The second monograph is meant to make the results of this research project more accessible to the general academic and perhaps even non-academic audience. Moreover, I have been using the results achieved in this project in my teaching, both at undergraduate and at graduate level. In fact, the constant interaction and exchange with students has been vital for shaping most of the core ideas of this project.

５．主な発表論文等

〔雑誌論文〕　計4件（うち査読付論文　4件／うち国際共著　2件／うちオープンアクセス　0件）

１．著者名 Ertl Wolfgang	４．巻 28
２．論文標題 Free Will, Foreknowledge, and Creation	５．発行年 2023年
３．雑誌名 Kantian Review	６．最初と最後の頁 497-518
掲載論文のDOI（デジタルオブジェクト識別子） 10.1017/S1369415423000444	査読の有無 有
オープンアクセス オープンアクセスではない、又はオープンアクセスが困難	国際共著 該当する

１．著者名 Ertl, Wolfgang	４．巻 27
２．論文標題 Marco Sgarbi: Kant and Aristotle. Epistemology, Logic, and Method	５．発行年 2022年
３．雑誌名 Kantian Review	６．最初と最後の頁 155-159
掲載論文のDOI（デジタルオブジェクト識別子） 10.1017/S1369415421000650[Opens in a new window]	査読の有無 有
オープンアクセス オープンアクセスではない、又はオープンアクセスが困難	国際共著 該当する

１．著者名 Ertl, Wolfgang	４．巻 22
２．論文標題 Marco Sgarbi: Kant and Aristotle. Epistemology, Logic, and Method	５．発行年 2022年
３．雑誌名 Japanische Kant-Studien	６．最初と最後の頁 124-127
掲載論文のDOI（デジタルオブジェクト識別子） なし	査読の有無 有
オープンアクセス オープンアクセスではない、又はオープンアクセスが困難	国際共著 －

１．著者名 Ertl, Wolfgang	４．巻 -
２．論文標題 Preparing the Ground for Kant's Highest Good in the World	５．発行年 2021年
３．雑誌名 Philosophia	６．最初と最後の頁 -
掲載論文のDOI（デジタルオブジェクト識別子） 10.1007/s11406-021-00330-w	査読の有無 有
オープンアクセス オープンアクセスではない、又はオープンアクセスが困難	国際共著 －

〔学会発表〕　計13件（うち招待講演　8件／うち国際学会　5件）

1．発表者名
Ertl, Wolfgang

2．発表標題
Kants Molinismus im Ueberblick

3．学会等名
Moral, Geschichte, Religion: Kants Religionsphilosophie als Angebot und Herausforderung an die Gegenwart（国際学会）

4．発表年
2023年～2024年

1．発表者名
Wolfgang Ertl

2．発表標題
Kant's Molinism, Part 1

3．学会等名
Princeton University（招待講演）

4．発表年
2022年

1．発表者名
Wolfgang Ertl

2．発表標題
Kants Molinism, Part 2

3．学会等名
Princeton University（招待講演）

4．発表年
2022年

1．発表者名
Wolfgang Ertl

2．発表標題
Kant on the Highest Good

3．学会等名
Princeton Project in Philosophy and Religion Meeting（招待講演）

4．発表年
2022年

１．発表者名
Wolfgang Ertl

２．発表標題
Divine Ideas and the Kant's Distinction: Augmenting the metaphysical two-aspects view

３．学会等名
History of Philosophy Roundtable, University of California, San Diego（招待講演）

４．発表年
2023年

１．発表者名
Wolfgang Ertl

２．発表標題
Free Will, Foreknowledge, and Creation: Further Explorations of Kant's Molinism

３．学会等名
Central Meeting of the American Philosophical Association（国際学会）

４．発表年
2023年

１．発表者名
Ertl, Wolfgang

２．発表標題
Kant's Molinism: A Clarification

３．学会等名
46th Annual Conference of the Japan Kant Society

４．発表年
2021年

１．発表者名
Ertl, Wolfgang

２．発表標題
Facets of Kant's Metaphysics of Freedom

３．学会等名
80th Annual Conference of the Philosophical Association of Japan

４．発表年
2021年

１．発表者名
Wolfgang Ertl

２．発表標題
Happiness, Holiness and the Transition to Religion. Reflections on Kant’s Second Postulate of Pure Practical Reason

３．学会等名
Guest lecture at University of Athens, Greece（招待講演）

４．発表年
2021年

１．発表者名
Wolfgang Ertl

２．発表標題
“Old Lampe needs to have a God” Re-reading Heinrich Heine after the Publication of "Kant: A Biography" in Japanese

３．学会等名
Tokyo Kant Research Group 339th Meeting (Online)（招待講演）

４．発表年
2021年

１．発表者名
Wolfgang Ertl

２．発表標題
Varieties of Noumena - The Divine Intellect and the Distinction of Things in Themselves and Appearances

３．学会等名
13th International Kant Conference, Oslo（国際学会）

４．発表年
2019年

１．発表者名
Wolfgang Ertl

２．発表標題
Kant's Molinism and the Guarantee of Perpetual Peace

３．学会等名
2018-19 Annual Meeting Pacific Study Group North American Kant Society, University of California at San Diego（招待講演）（国際学会）

４．発表年
2019年

１．発表者名 Wolfgang Ertl
２．発表標題 Ludewig Molina and Kant’s Libertarian Compatibilism
３．学会等名 2nd International Kant Summer School, The Johannes Gutenberg University of Mainz（招待講演）（国際学会）
４．発表年 2019年

〔図書〕　計2件

１．著者名 Wolfgang Ertl	４．発行年 2020年
２．出版社 Cambridge University Press	５．総ページ数 80
３．書名 The Guarantee of Perpetual Peace	

１．著者名 Ertl Wolfgang. Ed. by Waibel, Violetta L. / Ruffing, Margit / Wagner, David	４．発行年 2018年
２．出版社 De Gruyter	５．総ページ数 10
３．書名 "The Guarantee of Perpetual Peace in Kant: Remarks on the Relationship Between Providence and Nature" In Natur und Freiheit: Akten des XII. Internationalen Kant-Kongresses	

〔産業財産権〕

〔その他〕

―

６．研究組織

	氏名 （ローマ字氏名） （研究者番号）	所属研究機関・部局・職 （機関番号）	備考

７．科研費を使用して開催した国際研究集会

〔国際研究集会〕　計0件

８．本研究に関連して実施した国際共同研究の実施状況

共同研究相手国	相手方研究機関