<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>The homeland of the 'doghter of hooly chirche'? : the representation of Rome in Chaucer's Man of law's tale</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sub Title</td>
<td>「聖なる教会の娘」の故郷? : チョーサーの『弁護士の話』におけるローマ表象</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author</td>
<td>杉山, ゆき(Sugiyama, Yuki)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publisher</td>
<td>慶應義塾大学芸文学会</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publication year</td>
<td>2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JaLC DOI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genre</td>
<td>Journal Article</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The copyrights of content available on the KeiO Associated Repository of Academic resources (KOARA) belong to the respective authors, academic societies, or publishers/issuers, and these rights are protected by the Japanese Copyright Act. When quoting the content, please follow the Japanese copyright act.
The Homeland of the ‘doghter of hooly chirche’?  
The Representation of Rome in Chaucer’s  
*Man of Law’s Tale*  

Yuki SUGIYAMA

Many studies discuss medieval English literature in terms of cultural geography, and Chaucer studies are no exception. For instance, Jennifer Summit investigates the historical understanding evinced by the topographical accounts in medieval guidebooks to Rome, Francesco Petrarch’s ‘Letter to Colonna’, and Geoffrey Chaucer’s *Second Nun’s Tale*. According to her, some of these texts conceive of ‘the historical rise of Christianity as a conquest of space’ and write ‘a history of Christian Rome through the city’s buildings and landscape’. These narratives of the ‘conquest of space’ include not only hagiographies and guidebooks but also quest romances whose agents are knights rather than saints. Indeed, using the example of ‘The Tale of Gareth of Orkeney’ in Sir Thomas Malory’s *Le Morte Darthur*, Robert Allen Rouse observes that ‘[t]he world is written by the sword, incorporating new lands and subjects into the political landscape of the romance, and into the known world of the audience’. The newly acquired land is written by the narratives of the knights defeated by Gareth, and the obtained topographical knowledge is shared and acknowledged at Arthur’s court, the centre of the expansion and the site of Gareth’s departure.

The pattern of chivalric quest corresponds to the representation of space in the medieval world. This was developed mainly by topographical accounts, descriptions of sequentially related places and local features encountered by travellers. This textual mode of spatial construction may also be found in *The Man of Law’s Tale* (hereafter, *Man of Law*), which is a version of the ‘Eustace-Constance-Florence-Griselda Legends,’ according to the categorisation of romance by Lillian Herlands Hornstein, J. Burke Severs, Albert E. Hartung and Peter G. Beidler. In the *Canterbury Tales*, this tale can be regarded as a story that
foregrounds the history of the rise of Christianity; in particular, the ‘aventure’ of Custance’s maritime journeys seems to offer the story of the expansion of Christianity from Rome. This paper, after pointing out the conflation of spiritual and monetary values in the description of Rome in *Man of Law*, investigates the peripatetic travel of Custance in relation to the topographical representations of Rome, theoretically the site of supreme ecclesiastical authority in Western Christendom. Through Custance’s missionary ‘aventure’, *Man of Law* reveals the uncertainty at the centre of the expansion of Christianity, Rome, which, by the late-fourteenth century, had proven unable to serve as the earthly counterpart of the Holy Church.

It has been noted regarding *Man of Law* that the ‘relationship of texts and narrators, along with issues of narrative voice and intention, is at the heart of critical problems with the tale’.\(^5\) Certainly, while the Man of Law says ‘I speke in prose, and lat him [Chaucer] rymes make’ (II. 96) in the introduction, the prologue and the tale are both written in rime royal.\(^6\) This inconsistency between the introduction and the rest of *Man of Law* has produced varied responses to the relevance or appropriateness of the Man of Law as the teller of this tale. A. C. Spearing questions the very assumption that Chaucer intended each tale in the *Canterbury Tales* to delineate the character of each pilgrim who relates it, observing that the ‘I of most medieval narratives […] does not represent an individual person, real or fictional, but is merely one element in the rhetoric of storytelling; it is a textual phenomenon’.\(^7\) On the other hand, many critics, including V. A. Kolve, David Wallace, Cathy Lavezzo, and Gerald Morgan, assume that the character of the Man of Law is relevant to his tale.\(^8\) Although greatly indebted to such previous studies, this paper does not automatically assume the narrator of *Man of Law* to be the same Man of Law in the frame narrative of the *Canterbury Tales*, for such an attribution is not relevant to the argument of this paper.

Rather, what is of interest here is the representation of Rome in the accounts of the narrative voice of *Man of Law*. Mainly based on *Les Cronicles* (c. 1334), a long universal history written in Anglo-Norman by the English Dominican Nicholas Trevet (c.1257–c.1334), *Man of Law* recounts the wandering and ultimate homecoming of holy Custanc. However, the Rome it conjures up in the account of Custance’s voyage seems to be different from Trevet’s chronicle as well as from an analogue by John Gower (d. 1408), ‘The Tale of Constance’, in *Confessio Amantis*. According to Wallace, this difference arises from the inseparable connection between the mercantile power and spiritual values, as ‘[i]n Chaucer,
the expanded and then abruptly curtailed role accorded to the guild of Syrian merchants registers a challenge to the stable, hierocratic values of the Constance legend’.⁹

In fact, in the late Middle Ages, the identity of Rome was in crisis due to its ‘devastating and extreme turmoil’ although it retained its central status in Western Christendom mainly because of its presence in spiritual commerce.¹⁰ The Avignon papacy (1309–1377) and the subsequent Great Schism (1378–1417) ‘left Rome orphaned for a century’, and during these years the culture flourishing around the Curia seems to have faded away.¹¹ However, despite its loss of status as the centre of papal administration, Rome still attracted many people, including pilgrims, through its role as a centre of spiritual and commercial transactions.¹²

As a result of two plenary indulgences granted to the pilgrims who visited Rome in the Jubilee years of 1300 and 1350, the popularity of the Roman pilgrimage reached its height, accelerating the commercialization of grace.¹³ There was an inflation of the indulgences attached to the Roman churches and consecrated altars, and the city became dependent on this successful commercialism. Rome was regarded as a ‘Roote’ of ‘Pardoun’ in a Middle English guidebook.¹⁴ Such a view was clearly expressed by the Augustinian John Capgrave (1393–1464), who enumerated the reasons why Rome was the principal city of Christendom in Ye Solace of Pilgrimes (c. 1450), adding that ‘[m]en ñk ferurmore of grete reson ñt it [Rome] schuld be soo [the principal mother and nurturer of Christianity] for ñt multitude of martires whech spilt her blood in confirmacioun of our feith in ñt same place’.¹⁵ His emphasis on the city’s attractions for pilgrims attests to the fact that spiritual commerce was the ‘Roote’ of Roman religious authority. The receipt of pardons through pilgrimage could not be separated from commercialism, and the benefits brought by pilgrims and ecclesiastical business created and sustained the prosperity of Rome.¹⁶ It is certain that the conflation of spiritual and commercial values was not specifically late medieval but scriptural, as there are many mercantile expressions concerning salvation in Christianity. Nevertheless, that the doctrine of redemption could be arithmetically quantified invited the scepticism toward indulgences expressed by contemporaries such as the Lollards and probably Chaucer.¹⁷

Moreover, the absence of the pope from Rome might exacerbate the ambiguity of spiritual commerce.¹⁸ Because Christ entrusted the keys to St Peter, the pope was considered to possess the fullest authority to grant indulgences, while bishops only shared in a part of
this authority. The pope, as the steward or the spouse of the Church, was thought to have the authority to maintain the spiritual treasury which was abundant with merits thanks to the good works and suffering of Christ and the saints. The concept of the treasury of merits was antique in origin, but the culmination of its historical development came on 27 January 1343, when Pope Clement VI (1342–52) proclaimed the bull Unigenitus to announce the Jubilee observance for 1350. This event, which occurred during Avignon Papacy, might have encouraged further scepticism towards the successful spiritual commerce of Rome. It might, too, have called attention to the fact that the head of episcopal authority was inextricably tied to worldly business and not necessarily located at Rome, the supposed centre of Western Christendom.

The delineation of Rome in Man of Law has been understood by many as a reflection of the contemporary crisis of its identity. While Kolve, whose reading of Custance’s journeys as ‘the Ship of the Church’ is later presented in this paper, regards the joy of Custance’s homecoming as an allegory of heavenly bliss and Rome as the ‘true community’ for pious Christians in heaven. However, such positive interpretations of Rome as the moral and spiritual centre have often been questioned. Susan Schibanoff insists that Man of Law is motivated not by ‘a return to the austere and vigorous commitment to Christ of the early Church’ but by ‘the sense of a common vested interest among English men.’ Noting the period’s suspicion of the commerce in holy relics, Sarah Stanbury posits that Custance herself is traded as a living commodity among other inflated atonements, and reveals how the centrality of Rome is ‘shadowed with a troubled materiality.’ Lavezzo points out that not all late-medieval English writers, even those who did not deny Rome’s status as the source of canon law, acknowledged and celebrated the mythic centrality of Rome. By analysing the formation of England’s medieval identity based on its marginal geographical place in the popular imagination of those who had some knowledge of mappae mundi (medieval map-like objects representing the Christian symbolic worldview), Lavezzo clarifies the Man of Law’s desire to exalt his insular home and to bypass and surpass Rome as the centre of the Christian world. Acknowledging that the political turmoil aggravated Rome’s dependence on spiritual commerce and considerably shook its centrality, these previous studies perceive the construction of a positive or negative image of Rome in Man of Law. In either view, Rome is a focal point in the tale.

In Man of Law, the topographical representation of Rome is not constructed by
landscapes and buildings as in medieval guidebooks; rather, it is offered through the description of Custance’s journeys in the rudderless boat. Adding geographical details to the story taken from *Les Cronicles*, the narrator relates the ‘aventure’ that Custance endures during her voyage from Syria to Northumberland:

Yeres and dayes fleet this creature  
Thurghout the See of Grece unto the Strayte  
Of Marrok, as it was hire aventure.  
[. . .]  
She dryveth forth into oure occian  
Thurghout oure wilde see, til atte laste  
Under an hoold that nempnen I ne kan,  
Fer in Northhumberlond the wawe hire caste. (II. 463–65, 505–08)

The ‘aventure’, or destiny, of Custance is described by means of place-names and events traced in sequence—it is like an itinerary. Such a description might be an imitation of the geographical digressions conventional in ancient poetry. At the same time, the world imagined in the first and second wanderings of Custance seems to reflect the traditional *mappaemundi*. During Custance’s second drifting from Northumberland to the sea adjacent to Rome, her boat passes ‘the narwe mouth l Of Jubaltare and Septe’ (II. 946–47) and continues to drift until ‘Christes mooder [. . .] l Hath shapen, thurgh hir endeleeus goodnesse, l To make an ende of al hir hevynesse’ (II. 950–52). The line of ‘the See of Grece’, namely, from the centre of the *mappa mundi* (around Jerusalem or Rome) to the Pillars of Hercules, corresponds to the vertical stroke of the T in the T-O type *mappaemundi*; also, the Virgin Mary is often depicted at the top of *mappaemundi*, a position emblematic of her role as the intercessor for mankind. Custance’s wanderings merit analysis in light of medieval geography, since its visualisation, both textual and pictorial, seems to play a role in the construction of the image of Rome in *Man of Law*.

As Lavezzo, Sylvia Tomasch, and Wallace argue, Custance’s maritime journeys via ‘oure occian’ certainly evokes the worldview of contemporary *mappaemundi*, where Rome often shares the centre with Jerusalem while the isolation of the British Isles or Britain is
The verbal visualization of this model of world geography is appropriate in this context where the divine protection over the ‘aventure’ of Custance is emphasized, and the centrality of Rome is implied. Much as a *mappa mundi* ‘might stand as a representation of the world, for the transitoriness of earthly life, the divine wisdom of God, the body of Christ, or even God himself,’ the geographical description of Custance’s wanderings might function in relation to the narrator’s rhetorical questions. To explain why Custance can survive the desperate journey in the rudderless boat, the narrator encourages his audience to remember the plights of Daniel in the lion’s den (II. 472–75), Jonah in the whale (II. 486–90), and St Mary the Egyptian in the desert (II. 500–04). These references emphasize the divine intervention and protection of Custance. Similarly, if the description of her sea journey evokes *mappae mundi*, it conveys the message that all the events and creatures on the earth are within the scope of God’s plan.

On the other hand, the evocation of a Rome-centred worldview, along with the reading of Custance’s boat as ‘the Ship of the Church’, might suggest the central status and roles that Rome should have but does not. Kolve argues that both the ship carrying Custance and her entourage to Syria and the rudderless boat conveying her during her wanderings can figure the Ship of the Church, whose helmsman was often considered to be Christ himself, or even St Peter, as in Gower’s passage from *Confessio Amantis*: ‘[t]he schip which Peter hath to stiere’ (5. 1871). As the pope’s authority to grant indulgences was based on Christ’s giving the keys of the Church to St Peter, the propagation of Christianity and the edification of Christians should theoretically be emanated from Rome. However, in *Man of Law*, despite ‘the popes mediacioun’ (II. 234), the marriage of Custance to the sultan of Syria, which would have resulted in the ‘destruccioun of mawmetrie’ and the ‘encrees of Cristes lawe deere’ (II. 236–37), only meets the disdain of the Sowdaness:

We shul first feyne us cristendom to take—
Coold water shal nat greve us but a lite!—
And I shal swich a feeste and revel make
That, as I trowe, I shal the Sowdan quite.
For thogh his wyf be cristned never so white,
She shal have nede to wasshe awey the rede,
Thogh she a font-ful water with hire lede. (II.351–57)

The Sultaness’s assertion that she and her fellows can easily pretend to take the sacrament of baptism to assassinate Christians refutes the sacramental power of the Roman prelates. The powerlessness of the gospel and the ‘font-ful water’ sent by the Curia might suggest the loss of Rome’s power as the spiritual centre of Christianity. In addition, in this sole attempt of papal authority to spread Christianity, the town of Rome is depicted as a place which lacks the ‘philosophre’ who can calculate the suitable date of the marriage (II. 309–15), as if the city no longer attracts learned, competent clerics. Rome in Man of Law, unable to function as the religious centre, does not act as the Church’s steward or helmsman, who propagates Christianity and leads Christians to the righteous faith; rather, its religious authority is described as in decline from the beginning of the tale.

This decline of religious authority of Rome becomes clear through the absence of a cleric at the conversion scene and through the emphasis on divine providence, ‘the wyl of Crist’ (II. 511, 567, 721, 825) or God’s ‘sonde’ (II. 523, 760, 826, 902), which is not equated to the earthly church. In both Trebet and Gower, a Welsh bishop, Lucius, administers the sacraments of baptism and matrimony; he christens the constable, his wife, and Alla, and marries Alla to Constance.32 In Man of Law, however, no bishop is involved. Instead, the narrator gives attention to the involvement of the divine; Hermengyld converts through the grace of Jesus Christ (II. 537), and Alla is wedded to Custance through the mercy of Christ (II. 690). This stress on the direct intervention of God also appears in the conversion of the people around the constable. The miracle of the death of the knight who slanders innocent Custance, along with ‘Custances mediacioun’ (II. 684), causes the people to accept Christianity in Man of Law while in Les Cronicles, it is Constance who preaches the faith which is later tested by Lucius.33 The absence of the bishop and the pre-eminence of divine providence in Man of Law imply that episcopal authority is, like ‘the chaf’ or ‘the stree’ (II. 701), not worth mentioning because it cannot embody the God’s ‘sonde’.

Not only was any bishop absent in Man of Law, but there was also no mention of the head of the Church, the pope, and the absolution that he grants. Although Alla repents the killing of Donegild and comes to Rome to ‘putte hym in the Popes ordinance’ (II. 991), the pope does not appear thereafter in Man of Law. Even the name of the pope is not mentioned,
while in *Les Cronicles*, the pope in Rome is not only named but is one of the most important to hear of the ‘aventures’ of Constance:

> Et le roi a ceo tut en haut escrie: ‘J’ay trové ma femme!’ Puis Olda et Lucius ount salué la dame et a grant joie ount Dieux mercié, qe jammes ne faut a ceals qe en lui ount esperaunce. Lendemain le rois ala a prendre son absolucion de la mort sa mere, et puis q’il avoit counté al pape Pelagie, avant nomé, *totes les aventures*, le pape rendi graces a Dieu. [And at that the king cried out loudly, ‘I have found my wife!’ Then Olda and Lucius greeted the lady, and with great joy thanked God, who never fails those who have hope in him. On the morrow, the king went to receive his absolution for the death of his mother, and when he had told Pope Pelagius, before named, all the events, the Pope gave thanks to God.]

After giving the king absolution for his matricide, Pope Pelagius joins the rejoicing of Alla and his retinue. It can be said that the centre, embodied by the Roman pope Pelagius, hears and approves of the ‘aventures’ reported by the ruler of the newly acquired land. In ‘The Tale of Constance’, Pelagius also hears ‘the tale’ about ‘How wonderly this chance ferde’ (2. 1544). Through both Trevet’s and Gower’s versions of the Constance legend, the British Isles ruled and conquered by Alla are incorporated peacefully into the Rome-centred Christian world by the ‘aventures’ of Constance. Therefore, the lack of the reference to the papacy in *Man of Law* is noteworthy as it again indicates an ambiguity concerning the centre of Christendom. Although the centrality of Rome is suggested in the narrative of Custance’s maritime journeys, compared to its presentation in the versions of Trevet and Gower, Rome’s authority is reduced and seems not to be derived from its hierocratic power.

Moreover, according to the narrator, his intention is not to tell the story of Maurice, who is the only son of Alla and Custance and is made Emperor by the pope. The main point of *Man of Law* is not the incorporation of the British Isles into Rome or the union of the two regions, which might be embodied by Maurice. Rather, *Man of Law* is about the ‘aventure’ of Custance—‘Of Custance is my tale specially’ (II. 1125)—which ends after she has left Britain for Rome, where she finds her friends and father, the Emperor, safe and well:
To Rome is come this hooly creature,
And fyndeth hire freendes hoole and sounde;
Now is she scaped al hire aventure.
And whan that she hir fader hath yfounde,
Doun on hir knees falleth she to grounde;
Wепying for tendrenesse in herte blithe,
She heryeth God an hundred thousand sithe. (II. 1149–55, italics are mine)

Although Man of Law traces a plot of Les Cronicles, in which Constance propagates Christianity in Northumberland and ultimately returns to her homeland, the story of Custance is not about Rome’s conquest of the broader world. Instead, because of the lack of the members of the church and the narrator’s indifference to the incorporation of Northumberland into the Roman Christianity, Man of Law seems to indicate a discrepancy between Providence and Rome’s ecclesiastical authority. Like her wanderings ‘dryvynge ay | Somtyme west, and somtyme north and south, | And somtyme est’ (II. 947–49), the ‘aventure’ of Custance implies the instability of Rome’s identity as the spiritual centre of Christendom.

Stanbury points out that ‘[u]ncertainties about the time and form of the story itself also work to bracket Rome as a place of uncertain identity’. In fact, unlike Trevet’s version, Man of Law omits precise geographical and chronological details. Along with these omissions, the absence of hierocratic power in the missionary narrative of Custance suggests an ambiguity in the religious identity of Rome. Although the topographical representation of Custance’s journeys in a rudderless boat evokes the representation of the world in mappae mundi and suggests the centrality of Rome’s ecclesiastical authority, divine presence is manifested not through Roman priests and a Welsh bishop but through Providence. Christ’s ‘sonde’, which consistently protects Custance, the ‘doghter of hooly chirche’ (II. 675) and converts the people in the British Isles, is differentiated from hierocratic power. Presumably reflecting its contemporary conflation of spiritual and monetary values, Man of Law reveals the uncertainty of Rome’s identity. Compromised as it is seen to be in Man of Law, Rome cannot be the stable centre of Christendom or the earthly equivalent of the Holy Church which successfully sends its missionary to acquire an unknown space for Christianity.
Notes

* I would like to express my sincere gratitude to Professor Takami Matsuda of Keio University for his invaluable comments and encouragement. Also, my special thanks goes to Professor Yoshiko Kobayashi of Tokyo University for her insightful suggestions.


2 Ibid., p. 234.


6 In this paper, all quotations are from ‘The Man of Law’s Tale’, in The Riverside Chaucer, ed. by Larry D. Benson, 3rd edn (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), pp. 87–104.


9 Wallace, Chaucerian Polity, p. 211.


12 According to Margaret Harvey, ‘A major impetus [for people visiting Rome] was probably trade, both that connected with pilgrimage and more generally the hope of establishing a commercial foothold in a foreign centre’. See Margaret Harvey, The English in Rome, 1362–1420: Portrait of an Expatriate Community (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press,


Harvey, p. 2.

Stanbury insists that ‘the trading out of Custance, Rome’s most Christian commodity, also articulates, I believe, Chaucer’s particular uneasiness with the kind of materialist devotion associated with Rome’. See Sarah Stanbury, ‘*The Man of Law’s Tale* and Rome’, *Exemplaria*, 22.2 (2010), 119–37 (p. 123).


Shaffern, p. 29.

Ibid., pp. 23–28.

Ibid., pp. 24–27 (p. 26).

Kolve, p. 350.


Stanbury, p. 124.


For example, in the Hereford Map and the wall paintings at Winchester (St John’s Church, destroyed) and Chalgrove (St Mary’s Church), the Virgin Mary shows her breast to Christ so that her son might grant grace to people. See Naomi Reed Kline, *Maps of Medieval Thought: The Hereford Paradigm* (Woodbridge: Boydell, 2001), pp. 64–70.


David Woodward, ‘Medieval Mappaemundi’ in *The History of Cartography*, 6 vols (Chicago,
Kolve, pp. 302–49. According to Kolve, the idea of the Church as the ship led by St Peter goes back at least to St Hippolytus, but Augustine ‘gave the figure its greatest currency’ (p. 313). The quotation from Confessio Amantis is John Gower, Confessio Amantis, ed. by Russel A. Peck with Latin translation by Andrew Galloway, 3 vols (Kalamazoo, MI: Western Michigan University, 2004–2013), iii (2004), p. 76.

According to Friedman, the missionary impulse of Christianity can be figuratively said to be the desire to draw back to the centre, Jerusalem, the pagan, often monstrous races inhabiting the edges of the world. Such a desire was expressed, for example, in the letter sent to Prester John from the Pope Alexander III in 1177. See John Block Friedman, Monstrous Races in Medieval Art and Thought (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1981), pp. 59, 75.


Correale and Hamel, pp. 306–07.

d Ibid., pp. 324–25. Italics are mine.


Christine M. Rose argues that Trevet, who is said to have dedicated his chronicle to Mary of Woodstock, a sister of Edward II, represents ‘a force for the political consolidation of the world under Christianity’ by literate, learned, and even physically strong Constance, the future mother of Maurice, the Emperor of Rome. See Christine M. Rose, ‘Chaucer’s Man of Law’s Tale: Teaching Through the Sources’, College Literature, 28.2 (2001), 155–77 (p. 158).

Stanbury, p. 130.

Edward A. Block, ‘Originality, Controlling Purpose, and Craftsmanship in Chaucer’s Man of Law’s Tale’, PMLA, 68.3 (1953), 572–616 (pp. 580–81).